

Re: DD12236

Modeling sources of the gamma-ray bursts using quasispherical Szekeres metrics

by Andrzej Krasinski

Dear Professor Krasinski,

The above manuscript has been reviewed by a new referee, as you had requested. Comments from the report appear below.

We regret that in view of these comments we cannot accept the paper for publication in Physical Review D.

Yours sincerely,

Ansar Fayyazuddin

Associate Editor

Physical Review D

Email: prd@aps.org

<http://journals.aps.org/prd/>

Report of Referee B – DD12236/Krasinski

I do not think that this paper advances our understanding of GRBs. In addition to the criticisms presented by a previous referee, which I endorse, I find the explanation proposed for GRBs quite improbable and probably unnecessary.

The recent LIGO/VIRGO observation of a NS-NS merger followed by a short Gamma Ray Burst is a clear evidence that the sGRBs are associated with merger events. Longer GRBs are usually associated to the end of massive stars. Unless the author has compelling reasons to reject such common and 'simple' explanations for GRBs, and can show that his exotic model provides a better explanation (e.g. by predicting phenomena that one would not associate with stellar origins), I do not think this model is worth publishing in Phys Rev D.